

**CITY OF LONG BEACH  
CITIZEN POLICE COMPLAINT  
COMMISSION AGENDA**

**THURSDAY, MARCH 10, 2016  
333 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD  
COUNCIL CHAMBER, 6:30 PM**

David Clement, Chair  
B. Terhune (Terry) Beebe, Vice Chair  
Raúl A. Añorve, Commissioner  
Josephine Castellanos, Commissioner  
Alvaro Castillo, Commissioner  
José M. Flores, Commissioner



Crystal Howard-Johnson, Commissioner  
Richard Lindemann, Commissioner  
Miles Nevin, Commissioner  
Jeffrey Price, Commissioner  
Suely Saro, Commissioner

Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director

---

**CALL TO ORDER**

**ROLL CALL**

**CONSENT CALENDAR**

1. 16-016CP Recommendation to receive, file and close the following cases due to lack of evidence and/or witness cooperation or staff recommendation:

<u>CPCC NO.</u>	<u>ALLEGATION(S)</u>
15-280	Unbecoming Conduct
15-281	Unbecoming Conduct
15-286	Unbecoming Conduct & Dishonesty
15-066	Failure to Investigate

**Suggested Action:** Approve recommendation.

**REGULAR AGENDA**

2. 16-017CP Recommendation to approve the minutes of the Citizen Police Complaint Commission Regular Meeting held Thursday, February 11, 2016.

**Suggested Action:** Approve recommendation.

3. 16-004CP Recommendation to declare proposed Amendment to the Citizen Police Complaint Commission Policies and Procedures, read and adopted as read.

**Suggested Action:** Approve recommendation.

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

Members of the public have a five-minute time limit to address the Commission on items of interest to the public within the Commission's jurisdiction. Each speaker will be limited to five (5) minutes unless that time is extended by the Chair.

**RECOGNITION OF OUTGOING COMMISSIONER CRYSTAL HOWARD-JOHNSON**

**EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

**REMARKS FROM THE CHAIR AND COMMISSIONERS**

**RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION**

Recess to Closed Session in the Council Lounge, pursuant to Section 54957 of the California Government Code, for the purpose of consideration of personnel discipline matters.

**RECONVENE FROM CLOSED SESSION**

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

Opportunity is given to those members of the public who have not addressed the Commission on non-agenda items. Each speaker is limited to five (5) minutes unless extended by the Chair.

4. 16-018CP            Recommendation to receive Commission's vote and refer findings to the City Manager.

**Suggested Action:**        Approve recommendation.

**ADJOURNMENT**

I, Carolyn Hill, City Clerk Specialist, certify that the agenda was posted not less than 72 hours prior to the meeting. Carolyn Hill Date: 3/7/16

jn

If oral language interpretation for non-English speaking persons is desired or if a special accommodation is desired pursuant to the Americans with Disabilities Act, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Charter Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang interpretasyon ng sinasalitang wika para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles o kung nais ang isang natatanging tulong ayon sa Americans with Disabilities Act, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Charter Commission.

Si desea interpretación oral en otro idioma para personas que no hablan inglés o si desea una adaptación especial en conformidad con la Ley de Estadounidenses con Discapacidades, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión de estatutos.

បើមានការចង់បានឱ្យមានការបកប្រែភាសាផ្ទាល់មាត់ឱ្យអ្នកមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស ឬបើមានការចង់បានឱ្យមានដំណោះស្រាយពិសេសដោយយោងតាមមាត្រាច្បាប់ស្តីពី ជនពិការអាមេរិកាំង សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅទៅការិយាល័យសៀវ ក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹងចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំ គណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារសិទ្ធិរបៀបវារៈ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យអ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅការិយាល័យស្មើនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹងចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។

**CITY OF LONG BEACH  
CITIZEN POLICE COMPLAINT  
COMMISSION MINUTES**

**THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 11, 2016  
333 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD  
COUNCIL CHAMBER, 6:30 PM**

David Clement, Chair  
B. Terhune (Terry) Beebe, Vice Chair  
Raúl A. Añorve, Commissioner  
Josephine Castellanos, Commissioner  
Alvaro Castillo, Commissioner  
José M. Flores, Commissioner



Crystal Howard-Johnson, Commissioner  
Richard Lindemann, Commissioner  
Miles Nevin, Commissioner  
Jeffrey Price, Commissioner  
Suely Saro, Commissioner

Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director

**FINISHED AGENDA & DRAFT MINUTES**

**CALL TO ORDER (6:35 PM)**

At 6:35 PM, Chair Clement called the meeting to order.

**ROLL CALL (6:36 PM)**

**Commissioners** Raúl Añorve, Josephine Castellanos, José M. Flores, Richard  
**Present:** Lindemann, Miles Nevin, Jeff Price, Beekman "Terry" Beebe and  
David Clement  
**Commissioners** Alvaro Castillo, Crystal Howard-Johnson and Suely Saro  
**Absent:**

Also present: Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director; Celenia Perez, Special Investigator;  
Natasha Myers, Special Investigator; Wally Hebeish, Commander, Long Beach Police  
Department; Carolyn Hill, City Clerk Specialist.

**CONSENT CALENDAR (6:36 PM)**

Passed the Consent Calendar

**A motion was made by Commissioner Price, seconded by  
Commissioner Nevin, to approve Consent Calendar Item. The  
motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Raúl Añorve, José M. Flores, Richard Lindemann, Miles Nevin, Jeff Price, Beekman "Terry" Beebe and David Clement

**Abstain:** 1 - Josephine Castellanos

**Absent:** 3 - Alvaro Castillo, Crystal Howard-Johnson and Suely Saro

1. 16-011CP Recommendation to receive, file and close the following cases due to lack of evidence and/or witness cooperation or staff recommendation:

<u>CPCO NO.</u>	<u>ALLEGATION(S)</u>
15-080	Unbecoming Conduct
15-203	Dishonesty
15-046	Unbecoming Conduct
15-195	Unbecoming Conduct
15-045	Unbecoming Conduct

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

**REGULAR AGENDA (6:37 PM)**

2. 16-012CP Recommendation to approve the minutes of the Citizen Police Complaint Commission Special Meeting held Thursday, January 28, 2016.

**A motion was made by Vice Chair Beebe, seconded by Commissioner Añorve, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Raúl Añorve, José M. Flores, Richard Lindemann, Miles Nevin, Jeff Price, Beekman "Terry" Beebe and David Clement

**Abstain:** 1 - Josephine Castellanos

**Absent:** 3 - Alvaro Castillo, Crystal Howard-Johnson and Suely Saro

3. 16-003CP Recommendation to declare proposed Amendment to the Citizen Police Complaint Commission By-Laws, read and adopted as read.

Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director, presented the staff report.

Commissioner Flores spoke.

Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director, spoke.

Commissioner Price spoke.

Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director, spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Price and Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director.

Commissioner Añorve spoke.

Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director, spoke.

Carolyn Hill, City Clerk Specialist, spoke.

Commissioner Añorve spoke.

Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director, spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Añorve and Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director.

**A motion was made by Vice Chair Beebe, seconded by Commissioner Lindemann, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 8 - Raúl Añorve, Josephine Castellanos, José M. Flores, Richard Lindemann, Miles Nevin, Jeff Price, Beekman "Terry" Beebe and David Clement

**Absent:** 3 - Alvaro Castillo, Crystal Howard-Johnson and Suely Saro

4. 16-004CP Recommendation to declare proposed Amendment to the Citizen Police Complaint Commission Policies and Procedures, read and adopted as read.

Commissioner Añorve spoke.

Commissioner Price spoke.

Commissioner Añorve spoke.

Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director, spoke.

Commissioner Añorve spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Añorve and Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director.

Commissioner Price spoke.

Commissioner Añorve spoke.

Chair Clement spoke.

Commissioner Price spoke.

Carolyn Hill, City Clerk Specialist, spoke.

Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director, spoke.

Commissioner Añorve spoke.

Commissioner Price spoke.

Commissioner Añorve spoke.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Price, seconded by Vice Chair Beebe, to approve recommendation, as amended, to Section 4.D. and laid over to the next regular meeting of the Citizen Police Complaint Commission for final reading. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Raúl Añorve, Josephine Castellanos, Richard Lindemann, Miles Nevin, Jeff Price, Beekman "Terry" Beebe and David Clement

**Abstain:** 1 - José M. Flores

**Absent:** 3 - Alvaro Castillo, Crystal Howard-Johnson and Suely Saro

**PUBLIC COMMENT (7:04 PM)**

16-015CP Patrick Crosby spoke; and submitted a handout.

**This CP-Agenda Item was received and filed.**

Mr. Pollitt spoke regarding Natalia Skriabina's case.

Natalia Skriabina spoke regarding her case.

Chair Clement thanked the speakers.

**EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT (7:18 PM)**

Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director, thanked the speakers and the translator.

**REMARKS FROM THE CHAIR AND COMMISSIONERS (7:18 PM)**

There were no remarks.

**RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION (7:18 PM)**

At 7:18 PM, there being no objection, Chair Clement recessed the meeting to Closed Session.

**RECONVENE FROM CLOSED SESSION (9:54 PM)**

At 9:54 PM, Chair Clement reconvened the meeting.

**SECOND ROLL CALL (9:54 PM)**

**Commissioners** Raúl Añorve, Josephine Castellanos, José M. Flores, Richard  
**Present:** Lindemann, Miles Nevin, Jeff Price, Beekman "Terry" Beebe and  
David Clement

**Commissioners** Alvaro Castillo, Crystal Howard-Johnson and Suely Saro  
**Absent:**

5. 16-013CP Recommendation to receive Commission's vote and refer findings to the City Manager.

Chair Clement reported out from Closed Session the following actions taken: [1] Case No. 15-043 Commissioners voted 7-1 on Allegation No. 1; and 8-0 on Allegation Nos. 2 and 3; [2] Case No. 15-051 Commissioners voted 5-3 on Allegation No. 1 on First Officer accused; and 7-0 and one (1) abstain on Allegation Nos. 1 and 2 on Second and Third Officer accused; [3] Case No. 15-042 Commissioners voted 6-2 on Allegation No. 1; and 8-0 on Allegation No. 2; [4] Case No. 15-030 Commissioners voted 8-0 on Allegation Nos. 1 and 2; [5] Case No. 15-081 Commissioners voted 7-1 on Allegation No. 1; 8-0 on Allegation Nos. 2 and 3; 7-1 on Allegation No. 4; and 8-0 on Allegation No. 5; [6] Case No. 15-044 Commissioners voted 8-0 on Allegation Nos. 1 and 2; [7] Case No. 15-048 Commissioners voted 8-0 on Allegation No. 1; [8] Case No. 15-047 Commissioners voted 8-0 on Allegation No. 1; 7-1 on Allegation No. 2; 8-0 on Allegation No. 3; and 7-1 on Allegation No. 4; [9] Case No. 15-079 Commissioners voted 8-0 on Allegation Nos. 1 - 3; and [10] Case No. 15-078 Commissioners voted 8-0 on Allegation No. 1.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Price, seconded by Vice Chair Beebe, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 8 - Raúl Añorve, Josephine Castellanos, José M. Flores, Richard Lindemann, Miles Nevin, Jeff Price, Beekman "Terry" Beebe and David Clement

**Absent:** 3 - Alvaro Castillo, Crystal Howard-Johnson and Suely Saro

**ADJOURNMENT (9:59 PM)**

At 9:59 PM, there being no objection, Chair Clement declared the meeting adjourned.

ch

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ: នឹងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យអ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅការិយាល័យស្មើនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹងចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។

**CITY OF LONG BEACH  
CITIZEN POLICE COMPLAINT  
COMMISSION AGENDA**

**THURSDAY, MARCH 10, 2016  
333 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD  
COUNCIL CHAMBER/LOUNGE, 6:30 PM**

David Clement, Chair  
B. Terhune (Terry) Beebe, Vice Chair  
Raúl A. Añorve, Commissioner  
Josephine Castellanos, Commissioner  
Alvaro Castillo, Commissioner  
José M. Flores, Commissioner



Crystal Howard-Johnson, Commissioner  
Richard Lindemann, Commissioner  
Miles Nevin, Commissioner  
Jeffrey Price, Commissioner  
Suely Saro, Commissioner

Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director

**CLOSED SESSION**

Closed Session pursuant to Section 54957 of the California Government Code for the purpose of consideration of personnel discipline matters.

1. 16-019CP	<u>CPCC NO.</u>	<u>ALLEGATION(S)</u>
	15-060	Unbecoming Conduct.
	15-190	Harassment, Retaliation and Unbecoming Conduct.
	15-056	Unbecoming Conduct.
	15-065	Failure to Investigate and Unbecoming Conduct.
	15-230	Failure to Take Action, Harassment and Failure to Investigate.
	15-054	Use of Force, Misappropriation of Property and Unbecoming Conduct.
	15-077	Use of Force.
	15-161	Failure to Investigate.
	15-062	Use of Force.
	15-279	Unbecoming Conduct, Racial Bias Policing and Failure to Care for Property.

I, Carolyn Hill, City Clerk Specialist, certify that the agenda was posted not less than 72 hours prior to the meeting. Carolyn Hill Date: 3/7/16

jn

If oral language interpretation for non-English speaking persons is desired or if a special accommodation is desired pursuant to the Americans with Disabilities Act, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Charter Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang interpretasyon ng sinasalitang wika para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles o kung nais ang isang natatanging tulong ayon sa Americans with Disabilities Act, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Charter Commission.

Si desea interpretación oral en otro idioma para personas que no hablan inglés o si desea una adaptación especial en conformidad con la Ley de Estadounidenses con Discapacidades, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión de estatutos.

បើមានការចង់បានឱ្យមានការបកប្រែភាសាផ្ទាល់មាត់ឱ្យអ្នកមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស  
ឬបើមានការចង់បានឱ្យមានដំណោះស្រាយពិសេសដោយយោងតាមមាត្រាច្បាប់ស្តីពី  
ជនពិការអាមេរិកាំង សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅទៅការិយាល័យសៀន  
ក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹងចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំ  
គណៈកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបវារៈ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យអ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅការិយាល័យស្មៅនៃក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹងចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។